

**Joel D. Heck (ed.) *C.S. Lewis and E.M.W. Tillyard , The Personal Heresy: A Controversy,*
Review by Brendan N. Wolfe
The C.S. Lewis Chronicle Vol. 6, No. 2, Trinity 2009**

The Personal Heresy: A Controversy. By C.S. Lewis and E.M.W. Tillyard. Edited by Joel D. Heck, with an introduction by Bruce L. Edwards. Austin, Texas: Concordia University Press, 2008. 129 pp. ISBN 1881848108.

The Personal Heresy: A Controversy records a long-running debate in print between C.S. Lewis and E.M.W. Tillyard. The first three essays were printed in the periodical *Essays and Studies* in 1934, 1935, and 1936. To these, three additional essays were added, together with a concluding note by Lewis and a joint Preface, to make the book first published in 1939 by OUP, and reprinted in 1965. The work under review is the first reprint since then, edited and annotated by Joel Heck (author of *Irrigating Deserts*, also reviewed in this issue) and with an introduction by Bruce Edwards (editor of *C.S. Lewis: Life, Works, and Legacy*). The volume is well presented and nicely bound.

Both the introduction and notes are aimed at the reader familiar with Lewis' fiction and Christian apologetics, who is coming for the first time to his criticism. Edwards unabashedly takes Lewis' side in the controversy; and Heck's notes rarely provide the full citations a literary scholar would desire. The introduction is most concerned with situating the exchange in Lewis' corpus, and blames Tillyard for driving the conversation off-track. Meanwhile, the notes translate foreign languages and attempt to clarify obscure allusions. There is a certain amount of unevenness here (it is unclear why some quotations are identified and some not), the occasional mistake (e.g. 'Old English' for 'Middle English' in note 35), and some rather glaring gaps (Robert Herrick's poem 'Upon Julia's Clothes', to which reference is often made, would have fit easily in a note), but it is likely that the annotation will serve its purpose of keeping the target reader from feeling bewildered. This is a welcome and worthy re-edition.

Brendan N. Wolfe